IDENTIFYING EDWARD SOUTHWORTH OF LEIDEN

by

Dr. Brian A. Smith

©2023

<u>IDENTIFICATION OF EDWARD SOUTHWORTH OF LEIDEN</u> by Dr. BRIAN A. SMITH

fonts & colors used: errors in original test [my additions] sources in Arial Narrow Wikitree discussion 7 Alleged Royal Ancestry of Edward Southworth Proof of Southworth royal descent & Refutation 14 Visitation of Nottingham 1569 – 1614 16 ABSTRACT OF WILLS Southworth Richard 17 Robert Ellen Thomas Edward Letter to Blackburn Grammar School at Blackburn 20 1938 Petition to New England Historic Gen Soc 21 1940 letter w/results of petition 26 28 Summary & findings

https://www.wikitree.com/wiki/Southworth-110

Edward Southworth

Records indicate he was almost certainly from the Southworth of Nottinghamshire where there are proven connections to other members of the Leiden congregation. The exact connection is unknown. [There are no known connections]

Edward Southworth of Leyden was born 12 April 1585 at Clarborough, Nottinghamshire, son of Richard Southworth of Clarborough and Immyn Aston; and this Richard was son of Richard Southworth of Clarborough and Welham and Emma Levesey of Keeton (in Nottinghamshire). [A son was born; whether or not he lived in Leiden is not known]

Edward Southworth was born circa 1590 in England to Thomas Southworth and Rosamond Lister. His grandfather, Sir John Southworth and his parents, Thomas Southworth and Rosamond Lister were living in London when he was born (Weis, 127-28; Weis in Ancestral Roots . . .).

Edward Southworth is listed as number seven of seven sons of Thomas Southworth and Rosamond Lister. His brother Thomas Southworth had a residence in Leyden, Holland in 1613 (Melton/Sharp).

Edward Southworth, born 1590 in (Salmesbury) England, and Alice Carpenter born 1591 in Wrington, England and died 27 March 1670 in Plymouth. They married in May 28, 1613 in Leyden Holland. Alice was the daughter of Alexander Carpenter, a prominent member of the Separatist movement (United Brethren) - separating from the Church of England. Edward did not come to America; he died in 1620 in England, having been married a mere 7 years. It has been mentioned that the branch of Southworths from which Edward descended died young typically. He died at 30. His siblings averaged 33 years of life.

Plaats Leiden

Marriage May 28, 1613 Leiden Eduwaert Sodtwaert and Els Carpenter

Date Intention for Marriage- Datum ondertrouw: May 4, 1613 Leiden,

Marriage: May 28, 1613 Leiden

Groom-Bruidegom: Eduwaert Sodtwaert

Place of Birth-Plaats geboorte: england- Engelant

Occupation-Beroep: saaiwerker

Bride- Bruid: Els Carpenter

Place of Birth-Plaats geboorte: England- Engelant

Remarks-Opmerkingen:

Witnesses groom-Getuigen bruidegom:

Tomas Sodtwaert brother- broer – Samuel Fuller brother in law -zwager – Rogier Wilson acquaintance-bekende

Witnesses bride-Getuigen bruid:

Anna Ras acq.-bekende – Elysabeth Gennings acq. -bekende –

Maiden names with bride- Meisjesnamen getuige buid: Carlisle en Lisle. [?]

Edward was born a "gentleman" at Samlesbury, but he was the 7th son, the youngest son, and had to work for his living. He was a "say weaver" who did not earn a lot of money and he was a Protestant. The Pilgrims treated Edward as being of a higher social standing, or "well-to-do". Note: Say Weavers made "say" - used in making table cloths bedding etc. [there is no record of Edward being involved with the Separatist, pilgrim, movement- in fact neither he or Thomas are mentioned in any records of the separatist churches in Notts or in Leiden and the churches he was affiliated with in Leiden were NOT pilgrim churches, they were Anglican Churches in the Netherlands. Pilgrims would not be associated with the Anglican Church in the colonies, e.g. Saint George's in Hempstead.]

Edward and Alice had two sons, Constant and Thomas. The widowed Alice Carpenter Southworth journeyed on the Ship Anne, arriving 1623 to marry Governor Bradford.

Alice Southworth left their sons (Constant, 9 and Thomas, 7) in England for schooling. They may have remained with their Aunt Julia Ann Carpenter who was married to George Morton. They came over to Plymouth with their Aunt Julia in 1628.

Alice married Governor William Bradford, governor of Plymouth Colony, on August 14th, a few days after the ship's landing. They had three children.

NOTES

Edward Southworth's parents are uncertain because there's not enough evidence Edward of London is the same person as Edward of Leiden (aka Eduwaert Sodtwaert) - see the note in Weis, p. 14, Line 9 #41. Apparently this is also covered in Mayflower Quarterly 88 (1992): 10-15, which I have been unable to locate.

This birth date [1590] is questionable because Edward is shown as the youngest son of Thomas and Rosamond in Sir John's will dated 1595 — unless the birth order in Sir John's will is reversed. In that case, Edward would be the oldest. The source for this information is ambiguous. Webber refers to Edward as the seventh son with five younger brothers. [6] [Webber is worthless]

Note: Edward Southworth of London and Zuid-Holland, Married Alice Carpenter 1590-1621, England and Zuid-Holland, Netherlands

COMMENTARY BY THIS SUBMITTER: The birth place of Edward Southworth is under challenge. [7] An earlier Magna Charta application also had him born in London. The family of Edward Southworth on the Melton/Sharp web page asserts, "In 1602, Edward and his brothers, including Thomas, were still in the neighborhood of Samlesbury, all listed as foreign burgesses with their father in the Preston (Lancashire) Guild Roll of that year. They were all mentioned by their grandfather, Sir John Southworth, in his will dated September 17, 1593. Sir John died November 3 the same year."

The Tracy Crocker data on Magna Charta.com states Edward Southworth of Sturton Le Steeple was a silk worker (citing a *letter from Robert Cushman to Edward Southworth at Heneage House, London, 17 August 1620* (Bradford's history of Plymouth Plntation, Boston, 1901, p. 86). [This letter is incorrect in recounting this Edward's death – see below – and therefore its other content is suspect]

COMMENTARY: Sturton Le Steeple is far east of Liverpool past Sheffield in the middle of England. Edward Southworth as a "foreign burgess" in a guild registered in county Lancaster [NOT Edward from Clarborough] traveled from north England to London and over to Holland, then back. He would have been more than a "silk worker." A 1982 unabridged dictionary defines a Burgess as a citizen of a town or borough, or (2) in England, a representative or a borough, corporate town, or university in the British parliament. This explain a 1602 connection in both county Lancaster (Lancashire) and London, as the Southworths would have needed living accomodations in London. His ancestral background suggests a person of affluence and influence.

[WRONG PERSON:] His death is identified as ca. 1621 from a "letter of Robert Cushman to Edward Southworth at Heneage House, London, 17 August, 1620, in Bradford's "History of Plimouth Plantation, Boston, 1901, page 86." Tracy Crocker on Magna Charta.com cites two references: S39 is book Ancestral of Roots of Sixty

Colonists . . . ; S110 has Pedigrees of Charlemagne Vol. II by Aileen Lewers Langston (see source lists here). Nine charts to royal lineage. (http://www.magnacharta.com, Tracy Crocker 2007). Charts: Mérovée - Merovingian Dynasty; Charlemagne Descendant Chart; William I - The Conqueror; Alfred the Great; Faulk V - King of Jerusalem; Geoffrey Plantagenet; Edward I - King of England; Lady Godiva; Glyndon H. Crocker, Jr. - Ancestry Chart

Edward Southworth was born abt 1590 and died abt 1621. In 1602, Edward and his brothers, including Thomas, . . . were all listed as foreign burgesses with their father in the Preston (Lancashire) Guild Roll of that year. They were all mentioned by by their grandfather, Sir John Southworth, in his will dated September 17, 1593. Sir John died November 3, 1593. Edward Southworth married Alice Carpenter, May 28, 1613 in Leyden, Holland with his brother, Thomas, as his attendant. She was born abt 1590 and died March 26, 1670 in Plymouth, Massachusetts. A record of Edward Southworth shows him at Leyden, Holland on November 13, 1610 as a witness. The record states he was from England.

"In 1622, William and Christopher, brothers of Edward Southworth of Samlesbury [NOT Edward Southworth of Clarborough], were still on the rolls of the Preston, Lancashire Guild, but Thomas and Edward were omitted, indicating they were dead." William was at the time of his grandfather's death listed at Holcroft, Lancashire (Melton/Sharp).

Sources [unreliable sources are highlighted in red]

- 1. Weis, Frederick Lewis. The Ancestry of Ensign Constant and Captain Thomas Southworth of Plymouth and Duxbury Massachusetts. (Dublin, N.H.: privately printed, 1958). FamilySearch.org LINK.
- 2. † e.g. Weis. Ancestral Roots, editions 6 and earlier.
- 3. <u>↑</u> Note that the line is called unsupported in Ancestral Roots after the 6th edition, and does not appear in Richardson's Royal Ancestry series.
- 4. ↑ French, Robert L. "Who Was Edward Southworth of Leyden?" in The Mayflower Quarterly, vol. 88 (1992):10-15.
- 6. ↑ Source: #S461 Page: p. 423
- 7.

 A Magna Charta site (http://www. magnacharta.com, Tracy Crocker 2007) states he was born about 1590 at London, England in county Middlesex. A book by Walter Lee Sheppards is probably the source.
- Cornell, Arthur Watson. "The Baronial Order of Magna Charta." Application No. 770, approved January 25, 1958.
 Edward Southworth born at London England circa 1590, died circa 1621 at Leyden, Holland, marrried at Leyden Holland to Alice Carpenter May 28, 1613.
- Crocker, Tracy Ashley 2007. "The Baronial Order of Magna Charta." The Baronial Order of Magna Charta, 1998-2006, Crocker ~ Ashley, 2007 Ref: [S39, S1100, http://www.magnacharta.com. [cites a letter from Robert Cushman to Edward Southworth at Heneage House, London, 17 August 1620 (Bradford's history of Plymouth Plntation, Boston, 1901, p. 86 that contains errors.]
- Editorial Board. Webster's Geographical Dictionary. G. & C. Merriam Co., Publishers, Springfield, Mass., 1955, page 336, map; page 592 Lancashire. A port of Lancaster shown on map as north of Cheshire County. Lancashire or Lancaster... NW England... industrial centers Liverpool, Manchester, "watering" places Blackpool, Fleetwood, Morecambe, and Heysham, Southport.... History: Region part of Anglo-saxon kingdom of Northumbria and of the Danelaw;... an important medieval fief which in late 14th cent. became a county palatine; Lancastrian line of English kings the heirs of John of Gaunt, Duke of Lancaster...

- Heritage Consulting. "Millennium File." The Generations Network, Inc., Provo, UT USA, 2003, (Ancestry.com).
 Created by the Institute for Family Research. Edward Southworth born 1590, Wrington, Somerset, England; died 1621, London, London County.
- Hills, Leon Clark. History and Genealogy of the Mayflower Planters. Genealogy Publishing Co., Inc., Baltimore, 1977). cited by Melton/Sharp.Langston, Aileen Lewers, James Orton Buck, and Timory Field Beard. Pedigrees of Charlemagne Vol. II. Genealogy Publishing Co., Inc. 1974-78, 1979, http://magnacharta.com. Nine charts to royal ancestry on site of "The Baronial Order of Magna Charta".
- "Melton/Sharp Ancestry Chart." http://members.cox.net/trm/SouthworthEdward.htm. Edward Southworth was born abt 1590 and died abt 1621. He married Alice Carpenter, May 28, 1613 in Leyden, Holland. A record of Edward Southworth shows him at Leyden, Holland on November 13, 1610 as a witness; he married Alice Carpenter at Leyden on May 28, 1613 with his brother, Thomas, as his attendant. The record states he was from England.
- Murray, Jane. The Kings and Queens of England. A Tourist Guide. Charles Scribner's Sons, New York, 1974. See Appendix for index and sources, local snapshots. Reference list page 235 for Elizabeth I, James I. Pp. 85-89.
- The New England Historical and Genealogical Register. New England Historic Genealogical Society, Boston 1845-present, Vol XIV, 1860, pp. 195-196; XV, 1861, 30. Published Quarterly.
- Webber, Samuel G., A.B., M.D.. A Genealogy of the Southworths (Southards) Descendants of Constant Southworth with a Sketch of the Family in England. Samuel Usher, The Fort Hill Press, Boston, 1905, page 2, Ancestry.com, http://www.Ancestry.com. Copy of the record at Leyden (not a photocopy). Pages 1-21, 417, 419-420, 423-426. SOURCE QUESTIONABLE
- Weis, Frederick Lewis; Walter Lee Sheppard. Ancestral Roots of Sixty Colonists ~ Who Came to New England between 1623 and 1650. Genealogy Publishing Co., Inc., Baltimore, 1976, fifth edition, http://magnacharta.com. Lineage of Alfred the Great, Charlemagne, Malcolm of Scotland, and Robert the Strong. Wheeler, W. A. Alden-Shedd Families - Part II.
- Crocker, Tracy Ashley 2007. "The Baronial Order of Magna Charta." The Baronial Order of Magna Charta, 1998-2006, Tracy Crocker, 2007 Ref [S39], http://www.magnacharta.com. S39 has book Ancestral Roots of Sixty Colonists . . . see source list here. Edward Southworth was born circa 1590 at London, county Middlesex, England. Weis, Frederick Lewis; Walter Lee Sheppard. Ancestral Roots of Sixty Colonists ~ Who Came to New England between 1623 and 1650. Genealogy Publishing Co., Inc., Baltimore, 1976, fifth edition. Lineage of Alfred the Great, Charlemagne, Malcolm of Scotland, and Robert the Strong. Edward Southworth was born circa 1590 at London, county Middlesex, England, the son of Thomas Southworth and Rosamund Lister.
- Cornell, Arthur Watson. "The Baronial Order of Magna Charta", Application No. 770, approved January 25, 1958.
 Edward Southworth married Alice Carpenter at Leyden, Holland on May 28, 1613.
- Crocker, Tracy Ashley 2007. The Baronial Order of Magna Charta, The Baronial Order of Magna Charta, 1998-2006, Tracy Crocker, 2007 (S39], http://www.magnacharta.com. Quoting Ancestral Roots of Sixty Colonists Edward Southworth married Alice Carpenter on 28 May 1613 at Leyden, Holland.
- Webber, Samuel G., A.B., M.D. A Genealogy of the Southworths (Southards) Descendants of Constant Southworth with a Sketch of the Family in England. Samuel Usher, The Fort Hill Press, Boston, 1905, page 2, Ancestry.com, http://www.Ancestry.com. Copy of the record at Leyden (not a photocopy). QUESTIONABLE
- Weis, Frederick Lewis; Walter Lee Sheppard. Ancestral Roots of Sixty Colonists ~ Who Came to New England between 1623 and 1650. Genealogy Publishing Co., Inc., Baltimore, 1976, fifth edition. Edward Southworth married Alice Carpenter on 28 May 1613 at Leyden, Holland.
- Samuel Gilbert Webber. A Genealogy of the Southworths (Southards) Descendants of Constant Southworth: With a Sketch of the Family in England. Fort Hill Press; 1905. SOURCE QUESTIONABLE
- Source S462 Title: The Ancestry of Ensign Constant and Captain Thomas Southworth Abbreviation: Southworth Gen. Weis Author: Frederick Lewis Weis, Th.D. Publication: Self-published, Dublin, NH, 1958
- CatorFamily.com Cator Family
- Brainerd, Dwight. <u>Ancestry of Thomas Chalmers Brainerd</u> (Montreal, Quebec, 1948) <u>Page 82</u>: He is the son of Thomas Southworth and Jane Mynne.

Alleged Royal Ancestry of Edward Southworth (referenced in above article) [https://www.wikitree.com/wiki/Space:Cochoit_Working_3]

There is in print, and can often be found on the internet, a royal ancestry for Edward Southworth.[1] [2] This line is no longer accepted, and is considered broken.[3] The primary problem is there is no actual evidence as to the English origins of Edward, and there are multiple other possibilities which all remain unproven. [4]

The line was originally developed and privately published by Dr. Frederick Lewis Weis in the 1950s. It subsequently appeared in Dr. Weis' well-known The Ancestral Roots of Sixty Colonists, (all editions 6th and earlier), which led to its wide-spread acceptance and is the reason it can be found on many trees on the internet. [1]

What is known with certainty is that:

- Edward Southworth was part of the Puritan separatist community living in Leiden. [No supporting evidence]
- He married Anne Carpenter in Leiden
- He had a brother Thomas Southworth who was present at his wedding.
- The marriage record states that Edward Southworth and Anne Carpenter were from England.
- The two sons of Edward Southworth and Anne Carpenter, <u>Constant</u> Southworth and Thomas Southworth, immigrated to New England.

So, the question is, who are the parents of Edward and Thomas Southworth of Leiden?

There are two primary theories: [and both are right as the Clarborough line came from the Samlesbury line]

- 1. They came from the Southworth family of Samlesbury, Lancashire and
- 2. They came from the Southworth family of Wellam and Clareborough, Notts.

1. The Lancashire Origins Theory

Weis postulated that they were the children of <u>Thomas Southworth of Samlesbury</u>, <u>Lancashire and of London</u>, and his wife <u>Rosamond Lister</u>. This would give the New England immigrants <u>Constant Southworth</u> and <u>Thomas Southworth</u> a well-known ancestry which includes a line to Edward III, king of England.

The primary argument that Weis put forward goes like this:

- Robert Cushman of the Pilgrim Company wrote a letter to Edward Southworth, formerly of Leiden, now living in London.
- If he was living in London in 1620, he was likely from London prior to his move to Leiden. [It does not follow at all; Edward took ill after leaving Leiden and got off in London for medical care.]
- If he was from London, then he was likely closely related to Thomas Southworth of Samlesbury who is known to have been living in London in the 1590s. [No supportive evidence]

- If he was closely related to Thomas Southworth of Samlesbury and London, then he is likely, actually the son of Thomas Southworth (since Thomas is known to have had sons Edward and Thomas). [Except all the Thomas & Edward Southworths living in Samlesbury have been accounted for and none left the area.]
- Since there are no other good candidates for his father, Edward Southworth of Leiden must be the same person as Edward Southworth the son of Thomas of Salmesbury. [A logical fallacy; without any evidence.]

Comment: <u>This is an absolutely awful string of assumptions</u>. Starting with number one, it is known that many of the Leiden congregation had moved to the same parish in London where the letter was addressed in preparation for the Mayflower voyage. He had a reason to be in London no matter who his father was.

Other than the fact that we have brothers Thomas and Edward living in Leiden, Thomas Southworth of Samlesbury is known to have sons named Thomas and Edward, **there is nothing to connect the Leiden brothers to the Samlesbury family.** But a name-is-the-same argument is not good enough, especially when we have better candidates. [There were a total of 5 Edward-Thomas brother combinations in England – Lancs, Notts & Yorks – at the time. I have dealt with each one, disproving every Lancs based brothers.]

The Nottinghamshire Origins Theory.

Are there any known connections connections to the Southworth family found in Wellam and Clareborough, Nottinghamshire? It turns out the answer is yes, quite a few.

In the 1992 Southworth article by William French, a connection between Rev. John Robinson, Rev. Richard Bernard, Rev. Richard Clyfton, Rev. John Smith, Mr. Hugo Bromhead, William Brewster, John Jennings, Elizabeth Pettinger, Thomas, Jane and Anne Peck, can all be shown by public records as having ties to the Southworth family of Notts.

One possibility, which has not been completely followed up on, is **Richard Southworth of Clareborough, Nottinghamshire**. He was a brother of Robert Southworth of Wellham. He had a son Thomas born in 1583 and a son Edward born in 1585. Dr. Weis knew of this family but quickly dismissed them without really having a good reason. The dates are approximately correct and this family did have Leiden connections. Richard is a strong candidate to be the father of the Leiden brothers.

There is also William Southworth of Heydon. He would have lived close to the Peck family of Heydon, which had close associations with the Pilgrims. His family is unknown, but should be investigated.

Arms of Southworth of Samelsbury Hall, Lancashire theory

Kirk Hess added this section, and I will answer the points raised.

From gen-medieval thread about the Southworth Arms petition to the NEGHS committee on heraldry which I assume they are in the proceedings archives (1932 and 1938; I am not a subscriber...) there was an embroidery among the effects of Governor Bradford that had the correct arms of Southworth of Samelsbury. It addresses the Nottingham theory which I summarized below, and there's some thought Edward and Alice's sons Constant

and Thomas were educated at Blackburn Grammar School. Also Edward and Thomas were on the guild roll at Preston until they died. For reference, Samelsbury Hall is about 5 miles from both Preston and Blackburn.

Comment: The SGM post was made without having read or having any understanding of the Mayflower Quarterly article. The **embroidered coat of arms has no weight** whatsoever. You don't know who made it, when they made it, or why they made it. Most importantly, it can't distinguish between the Southworth family of Samlesbury, and the Southworth family Nottinghamshire, as they essentially (minor tincture changes) used the exact same arms! [The Notts arms are a "differenced" form of the Southworth arms — and this does indicate a connection.] The Nottingham family was certainly [?] a cadet branch (connection unknown) to the Lincolnshire? family. [The same applies to the portrait of Alice Carpenter Southorth at Samlesbury Hall — there is no provenance and my belief is that it was an early 20th century reproduction of an earlier one — 17th or 18th c in U.S. — that was gifted to the Hall. It has (1) no business being there as the Southworths of Samlesbury would certainly not allow a portrait of a Protestant, especially an in-law to hang there.]

The Nottingham theory is apparently from Colonel Banks, English Ancestry and Homes of the Pilgrim Fathers 1929, which was addressed in this thread (I can't tell exactly the source of the refutation by Mary J. Sibley, Ph.D.) since the Wellam Southworths of Clareborough, Notts. had different Arms than Samelsbury Southworths, [they had DIFFERENCED arms, not different arms] and more importantly we know Thomas was at Edwards wedding to Alice Carpenter in Leiden, but the Nottingham pair, Thomas died before the wedding. Comment: This is directly addressed in the Mayflower Quarterly article. It is certainly true that Thomas, son of Robert Southworth of Wellham, died in 1612 and so he cannot be the one in Leiden in 1613. However, what is incorrect is that this closes the door on the Nottinghamshire theory - there are multiple other Southworths who also had sons Edward and Thomas which remain as possible father's of the Leiden brothers.

There's also some thought Alice's sons Constant and Thomas attended Blackburn Grammar School [no they were not per the school records] before they both emigrated to live in Plymouth, there's a history Blackburn Grammar School, by George Alfred Stocks, published in 1909 but those volumes are not available online, apparently Sibley checked they weren't in there and then wrote the school and received no reply or maybe the reply is in the NEGHS archive? Edward and Thomas's supposed eldest brother John was one of the Governors of the school. Comment: **No evidence** and it wouldn't matter as no connection is shown or proven.

Conclusions:

- The parents of Edward Southworth are unknown/unproved.
- There is no direct evidence that Edward Southworth of Leiden had any connections to the Southworth family of Samlesbury. The theory is entirely based on matching the names Edward and Thomas a name-is-the-same argument which does not constitute proof.

- The Leiden Southworths likely came from Nottinghamshire where there are proven connections to other members of the Leiden congregation. The exact connection is unknown.
- Richard Southworth of Clareborough who married there in 1569 Imogene Aston, and had 10 children including Thomas born 1583 and Edward born 1585 is the best candidate to be the father of the Leiden brothers. This is not yet proven.

Sources - Footnotes and citations:

- ↑ 1.0 1.1 Weis, Frederick Lewis. The Ancestry of Ensign Constant and Captain Thomas Southworth of Plymouth and Duxbury Massachusetts. (Dublin, N.H.: privately printed, 1958). FamilySearch.org LINK.
- ↑ e.g. Weis. Ancestral Roots, editions 6 and earlier.
- ↑ Note that the line is called unsupported in Ancestral Roots after the 6th edition, and does not appear in Richardson's Royal Ancestry series.
- ↑ French, Robert L. "Who Was Edward Southworth of Leyden?" in The Mayflower Quarterly, vol. 88 (1992):10-15. Source List:

French, Robert L. "Who Was Edward Southworth of Leyden?" in The Mayflower Quarterly, vol. 88 (1992):10-15.

Weis, Frederick Lewis. The Ancestral Roots of Sixty Colonists, 8th edition (2004):14, Line 9. See earlier editions for comparison. Southworth line called unsupported. Ancestry.com/LINK

Weis, Frederick Lewis. The Ancestry of Ensign Constant and Captain Thomas Southworth of Plymouth and Duxbury Massachusetts. (Dublin, N.H.: privately printed, 1958). FamilySearch.org LINK.

Kathryn Smith posted Mar 31, 2021

To add to research provided above:

Southworth Genealogical Research & DNA Study Project to be Conducted by the New England Historic Genealogical Society

The Southworth Genealogical Research & DNA Study Project's goal is to determine if Constant Southworth's (b. about 1612) and Thomas Southworth's (b. about 1617) ancestors descend from Samlesbury or Clarborough England. As Constant and Thomas Southworth's potential royal descent has not been definitively proven, I hope that by combining new genealogical research, male Southworth descendant Y-DNA testing and analysis through a New England Historic Genealogical Society study project that Constant and Thomas Southworth's descendancy will be resolved. Descendants of Sir John Southworth (b. 1526) and Mary Ashton will be identified for Y-DNA testing to compare DNA results against descendants of Thomas Southworth (b. c. 1548), Constant's and Thomas' grandfather. Additionally, this project will identify living male descendants of Richard Southworth (b. 1545) and his wife Imogene Aston of Clarborough, Nottinghamshire to compare DNA results. Contact me via private message for more project information.

Background: Earlier genealogical research was often accepted based on loose assumptions (See a discussion at: https://www.wikitree.com/wiki/Space:Cochoit_Working_3).

Additional Research and Analysis Since 1992: Under Gary Boyd Roberts, The Royal Descents of 900 Immigrants to the American Colonies, Quebec, or the United States (Baltimore: Genealogical Publishing Co., 2018), 1:708-709, Mr. Roberts first acknowledges the uncertainty of Edward's origins: "Edward Southworth, probably [emphasis added] the Leyden Pilgrim..." (p. 708). He then addresses Sue Allan's "In Search of Separatist Edward Southworth of Leiden" 2017 online monograph https://shop.americanancestors.org/products/in-search-of-separatistedward-southworth-of-leiden-his-genealogical-origins-uncovered?passthrough=true argument against Leyden as Edward's correct origin as Edward's father, Thomas Southworth of Samelsbury, Lancashire was a Protestant, while Thomas's father, Sir John Southworth, and two of Thomas' brothers were "sometime ardent Catholics variously imprisoned." Comment: My understanding is that during this period, most family members tended to practice the same faith, though there can be exceptions such as perhaps Thomas followed Protestantism to avoid being imprisoned. [Thomas, son of John, DID convert, which caused a rift and led directly to the accusation of Jane Southworth being a witch as it was her son that was the heir-presumptive. If she was deemed a witch, that line would be disinherited and the property would go to the next in *line to inherit – probably a younger brother.*]

Alternatively, Ms. Allan presents a circumstantial argument that Edward Southworth of Leyden was born 12 April 1585 at Clarborough, Nottinghamshire, son of Richard Southworth of Clarborough and Immyn Aston; and this Richard was son of Richard Southworth of Clarborough and Welham and Emma Levesey of Keeton (in Nottinghamshire).

Joe Cochoit posted Apr 01, 2021

I think you are down playing both the quality of Sue Allan's research and the evidence that she provides. Sue Allan is one of the the premier researchers on the English origins of the Leiden separatists. Edward Southworth was certainly not the son of Thomas Southworth of Samelsbury, and almost certainly the son of Richard Southworth of Clarborough. The Samlesbury theory should be considered disproved.

The DNA approach is unlikely to work. The arms of Southworth of Samelsbury and the arms of Southworth of Clarborough are similar (both being three cross crosslets between a chevron) showing that the two families are certainly related. You would expect both families to share the same Y chromosome.

Kathryn Smith posted Apr 03, 2021

Joe,

Please note that it is not my intent to downplay the quality of Sue Allan's research and evidence. Rather, based on Gary Boyd Roberts "The "Royal Descents of 900 Immigrants" quote below, it appears that further research may be required to definitively prove or disprove Edward Southworth's lineage as being from Clarborough. Mr. Roberts is a senior research scholar emeritus at the New England Historic Genealogical Society.

"Note that the surname of the mother [Aston] of the newly alleged Leyden Southworths of Clarborough [referencing Sue Allan's research], if Ashton rather than Aston (a common error), is that of the paternal grandmother [Mary Ashton) and of the formerly

alleged Leyden Pilgrim, Edward Southworth of Samlesbury...Further Ashton and Levesey [Emma Levesey of Keeton, wife of Richard Southworth of Clarborough and Welham; Edward's father according to Ms. Allan] research is eagerly awaited, as is more information on earlier Southworths of Clarborough, and clinching proof (or disproof) of one of these Edward Southworths as the Leyden Pilgrim and father of Constant and Thomas of Mass." Gary Boyd Roberts, The Royal Descents of 900 Immigrants to the American Colonies, Quebec, or the United States (Baltimore: Genealogical Publishing Co., 2018), 1:708-709.

It will be interesting to see how much DNA is shared between the Samlesbury and Clarborough Southworth lines to support the lineages.

Rod Piper posted Oct 04, 2019

This may help I am DNA connected to this family in the USA (Southworth.) I am a direct relative. I am *direct descendant of Sir Richard de Southworth and Lady Elizabeth Molyneux*. They are my 18th Great Grandparents. I am a descendant of their daughter Mary Southworth. I am *DNA linked to Constant Southworth and Thomas Southworth*. The thing is I can DNA pin point my DNA connecting to *these brothers*. [Edward and Thomas?] Also DNA connected to the Howland children of Captain Joseph Howland and Elizabeth Southworth. She is the grand daughter of Edward Southworth and Alice Carpenter.

My understanding now i that I am DNA connected to Edward Southworth, I am a the fifteenth great grandson of Sir William Houghton and Mary Southworth.

Mary had a brother Christopher De Southworth and this is his line. I am his 15th Great Nephew.

From: **Alleged Royal Ancestry of Edward Southworth** [https://www.wikitree.com/g2g/366945/alleged-royal-ancestry-of-edward-southworth]

Discussion on these sources:

- French, Robert L. "Who Was Edward Southworth of Leyden?" in The Mayflower Quarterly, vol. 88 (1992):10-15.
- Weis, Frederick Lewis. The Ancestral Roots of Sixty Colonists, 8th edition (2004):14, Line 9. See earlier editions for comparison. Southworth line called unsupported. <u>Ancestry.com LINK</u>
- Weis, Frederick Lewis. The Ancestry of Ensign Constant and Captain Thomas Southworth of Plymouth and Duxbury Massachusetts. (Dublin, N.H.: privately printed, 1958). FamilySearch.org LINK.

<u>Joe Cochoit, Oct 19, 2017</u>: We are still left with no supporting evidence for Lancashire origin theory. We have multiple connections of Mayflower pilgrims with the Nottinghamshire Southworths and several good possibilities for the parents of Edward and Thomas Southworth among the families found in Nottinghamshire.

One possibility, which has not been completely followed up on, is Richard Southworth of Clareborough, Nottinghamshire. He was a brother of Robert Southworth of Wellham. He had a son Thomas born in 1583 and a son Edward born in 1585. Dr. Weis knew of this

family but quickly dismissed them without really having a good reason. The dates are approximately correct and this family did have Leiden connections. Richard is a strong candidate to be the father of the Leiden brothers.

Joe Cochoit, Oct 18, 2017

Part the summary from the Mayflower Quarterly article:

"This summary and review of the records concerning the Southworth family and the Pilgrims in England and Holland points out very clearly that the identification of Edward as a member of the Lancashire family rests solely on the coincidence of names and dates. There has yet to be found any evidence that Sir John's grandsons, Thomas and Edward, had any connection with the Pilgrims or with Holland. In dramatic contrast, Rev. John Robinson, Rev. Richard Bernard, Rev. Richard Clyfton, Rev. John Smith, Mr. Hugo Bromhead, William Brewster, John Jennings, Elizabeth Pettinger, Thomas, Jane and Anne Peck, can all be shown by public records as having ties to the Southworth family of Notts. That family no longer suffers the handicap described by Hunter as having "no marriages, no collaterals, no younger children, no daughters." In addition to Robert of Clareborough and his sons Thomas and Edward, it now includes their 3 sisters, Robert's brother Richard and 10 children, including a Thomas and Edward, William of Hayton and Robert of Headon and 6 children."

Kathryn Smith Mar 13, 2021 descendants of Richard Southworth and his wife Imogene Aston of Clarborough, Nottinghamshire. According to the Southworth genealogy, Richard had ten children. Of them were a Thomas born 28 July 1583 and Edward born 12 April 1585. [Visitations of the County of Nottingham in 1569 and 1614]. Richard Southworth who married Imogene Aston was the son of Richard Southworth of Clarborough who married Emma Levesey. Richard and Emma's son Robert is named in the visitation books along with his children.

Proof of Southworth royal descent

posted by Jim Stevens in two parts, the 2nd posted on 30 March 1997 being at: https://groups.google.com/g/soc.genealogy.medieval/c/l2P9NvZgR-4/m/HoFwmQ2vU_sJ

This was copied from Kerri Southworth's web site at

http://users.aol.com/sforg/newsletters/edward01.htm

I know this is a lengthy post, but should be of immense interest to anyone descended from Edward Southworth of Leyden. Two facts of importance are contained herein:

- 1.) We know that Edward's brother, Thomas, was present at Edward's marriage to Alice Carpenter. There were two sets of Edward/Thomas brothers. The Thomas of Wellam, which branch has not been proven to be descended from the Southworths of Samulsbury hall, died before the wedding as proven by probated wills, copies of which are still extant. Though this does not in itself prove Edward of Leyden is the one descended from the Samulsbury Southworths, it does prove that his rival for the designation definitely was not. Edward of Leyden could not have been Edward of Wellam and Edward of Wellam definitely did not marry Alice Carpenter.
- 2.) The discussion regarding the heraldic background of the crest found in Alice's possession seems convincing to me, but I admit to no great knowledge of the field of heraldry. Apparently the heraldry committee of the New England Historic Genealogical Society was convinced.

NOTTINGHAM ORIGIN OF THE SOUTHWORTH FAMILY OF AMERICA: as given by Colonel Chas. E. Banks:

A REFUTATION by Mrs. Mary J. Sibley, Ph.D., 101 University Place, Syracuse, NY.

In his "English Ancestry and Homes of the Pilgrim Fathers", Grafton Press 1929, Colonel Banks on page 161 states that the Southworth family came from the vicinity of Fenton, Co. Notts, near Sturton le Steeple, home of Reverend John Robinson, and gives as his authority "P.R.O. British Public Records Office Exchequer Deposition 43044 Elizabeth Michaelmas. Number 3".

United States Library of Congress, in reply to my inquiry, states: - "It is believed the Library of Congress has all publications of the British Public Records Office but the reference is not to any printed book. It pertains to some MSS. manuscript material in the P.R.O.

In the recent work "Banks Topographical Dictionary of 2885 English Emigrants to America", Edited by Elijah Ellsworth Brownell, page 133 of the tabular index is found: - *Edward Southworth from the Parish of Sturton, settled in Plymouth, Massachusetts. Came on the ship ANNE. Authority "Banks MSS"*. Instead of Edward it should have stated "Widow of Edward" for it is authoritatively known that Edward was then dead and that Alice, his widow came on the ship ANNE in 1623.

The Banks MSS" alluded to was not in the collection of Banks MSS. in the Rare Book Room of the Library of Congress, neither is it in the New England Historic Genealogical Society Library, Boston, Massachusetts. However I found a list of *P.R.O. Exchequer*

Deposition by Commission from I Elizabeth to 18 James I"; "Names of 43,625 Deponents", arranged in 8 geographical groups, according to County to which the documents relate (Issued only to members of the Genealogical Research Co-operative Club). In volume I (1559 - 1620) page 36, under Group I, "York and Notts", I found the names of the deponents in the reference given by Banks. I had seen these names in a deposition in "Pastor of the Pilgrims - John Robinson", by Walter H. Burgess, 1920, which antedated Banks by nine years. Burgess gives the exact reference in a foot-note, page 376, and the full text of Edward Southworth's deposition, pages 379 to 381, which showed that Banks had accepted Burgess instead of making a personal search for the home of Edward Southworth of Leyden, Holland, and had failed to give Burgess credit in his "English Ancestry and Homes of the Pilgrim Fathers", Grafton Press 1929.

In the Boston transcript, February 25, 1932, the Nottingham version of the Southworths of Leyden, Holland and New England, by Burgess, was given in the transcript April 27, 1932, I cited some of the discrepancies in the Burgess theory. Burgess believed that Hunter "Founders of New Plymouth" 1849 had proved the puritanism of the Southworth family of Wellam, Notts, to which Edward of Fenton belonged, which is fully proved by Burgess, but he did not know that Hunter had confused two Robert Southworths (both of Notts) and so had not proved the religion of the Wellam Branch.

I called attention to the colorings of their (Notts) coat-of-arms, which was not the same as that brought to America by Alice Southworth, widow of Edward of Leyden, Holland. I showed that Burgess had not proved the Edward Southworth of Wellam was a firm and fast friend of John Robinson, pastor of the Pilgrims. They may have been, if ages given by Burgess were wrong, but he Burgess did not give anything to prove it. What he Burgess did give proof concerning, was the Pilgrim pastor's father knew Edward of Wellam's guardian, John Thornhagh, Sr. of Fenton and had served witness with said Edward's brother, Thomas.

Since writing the transcript articles, I have obtained additional abstracts of wills of the Wellam Southworths, which I shall give, without comment. In order to connect these at a glance, I shall give Edward Southworth of Wellam's report to the Herald in the Visitation of Nottinghamshire in 1614.

His identification with Edward of Fenton is fully proved by Burgess. Subsidy rolls of Sturton cum Fenton show that no Southworths were living there as land owners. The land he inherited from his father, Robert Southworth of Wellam, was at East Retford, Ordsall and Gringley - "on the hill".

During his minority he lived at Fenton with his guardian John Thornhagh, Sr. and was still of Fenton in 1602 when he made his deposition mentioned above, but, he was of Wellam when he made his will. His mother and unmarried brother, Thomas, had inherited the Wellam estate and were then both deceased.

Visitation of Nottingham 1569 - 1614 (Harl. pub. Volume 4, page 114.

AYMOND SOUTHWORTH of Wellam:

/----/

Richard Southworth m. Emma daughter of? Levesey of Clarborough and Wellam, of Keeton Keston? Notts. son and heir

/----/

Robert Southworth Ellen daughter of Harris of Clarborough of Bestropp, Notts.

|-- Elizabeth uxor George Harrison |-- Margaret uxor John Otter

\-- Edward Southworth of Clarborough and Wellam. Living in 1614 Married to: Anne daughter of Richard Elsam of West Radford, Notts.

ABSTRACT OF WILLS FOUND IN H.G. SOMERBY papers in New England Historic Genealogical Society Library (Boston):

RICHARD SOUTHWORTH of Wellome, Notts, yeoman September 7, 36 Henry VIII (1544), to be buried in the Church of Clareborough. Wife Emmot. Son Robert to have the farm at Clarborough where testators father lived when 24 years of age. Son Oliver. Brother Sir Robert Southworth, parson of Kirton. Brother Sir William Southworth, Vicar of Heden, and brother Sir Thomas Southworth whom I make my executor. Also I will that Sir Humphrey, my brother, shall not meddle with any part of my goods for I have agreed with him for his child's part. Michael Clerkson to be Supervisor of my will. Witnessed by James Southworth, Richard Bilbie, Robert Byse and Thomas Copton. Proved April 30, 1545. (Somerby Papers, Volume 53 page 313)

Note: Mr. Somerby does not state where the original will is found. I shall supply this from "York. Arch. and Top. Assn. Record Ser." as far as possible. - In volume XI. Wills in York Registry 1514 - 1553, page 165 "May 22, 1545 Southworthe, Richard, Wellome, yeoman, September 7,36 Henry VIII (1544). Volume 13 f 15".

ROBERT SOUTHWORTH of Wellam, Parish of Clareborough, November 20, 1580. To be buried in the Church. Wife Ellen, the lands &c. in Clareborough during her life, which I bought of Francis Worth, Esquire and John Dunstone, Gentleman. After her death to son Thomas and other lands &c. in Wellam and Tylney in County of Notts. To son Edward lands &c. in East Retford, Ordsal and Gringley in the hole (in Burgess - "on the hill") in County Notts. Son Edward not 21. Appoint the right worshipful Mr. Thornaghe

of Fenton, Esquire guardian to son Edward, Daughters Elizabeth, Alice and Margaret all under 21. Daughter Isabel married. Sir Thomas, Executor (his uncle, brother to his father, see will of Richard, above) and John Cadd, George Diccons, Oliver Southworth and Richard Southworth supervisors, to each he gives an angel of gold.

Proved October 8, 1589.

(Somerby Papers, Volume 51 pages 278 - 279)

(York. Ar. & Top. Rec. Ser. Volume 22 - Index of Wills in York Registry. - October 8, 1590 Southworthe, Robert, Wellam parish Clareborough, Notts, dated November 20, 1580. Volume 24 page 416)

This proves that his son Edward was the Edward Southworth at Thornaghe's in Fenton, his son Edward was Burgess has also shown in more detail; also the Edward had a brother Thomas.

ELLEN SOUTHWORTH, Wellam, Parish of Clareborough, Notts. Widow, April 29, 1609. Sons Thomas and Edward each 10/. Daughter Elizabeth, wife of George Harrison 10E. Daughter Margaret, wife of John Otter 10E. To Elizabeth daughter of Leonard Steele Style 10E. Other children of Steele name. To the children of William Ashton. Sons Thomas and Edward, executor and Richard Southworth and Thomas (Burgess had it "Dickons") Dickon, supervisor.

Proved January 22, 1612 - 1613.

(Somerby Papers, Volume 51 page 355)

Notice that on the same day her (ELLEN SOUTHWORTH) will was proved, her unmarried son's will was also proved (see below). Ellen was widow of Robert Southworth of the preceding will. This agrees with the report of her son Edward to the Herald in 1614. Both mention her daughter Elizabeth, wife of George Harrison and Margaret, wife of John Otter. Daughters Isabel and Alice were evidently deceased.

From Edward's will (below) we learn that a sister married Leonard Steele (Note: Somerby should have said Leonard STYLE - see below) and another sister married William Ashton. As Leonard Steele Style had the larger number of children I judge his wife was Isabel, who was married by November 20, 1580; and Alice, wife of William Ashton, who was then not 21.

(York. Ar. & Top. Rec. Ser. Volume 28 Index of Wills in York Registry 1612-1619 - "January 22, 1612 Southworth, Ellen, Wellam, parish Clareborough, Notts, widow, dated April 29, 1609 Volume 32 page 275)".

THOMAS SOUTHWORTH, of Wellam in parish of Clareborough, Notts, yeoman, July 18, 1612. To William Fairbank, Edward Loveden, George Parkin, Widow Packin (?), Davis Markham and Gilbert Swifte. Brother Edward and sister Elizabeth Harrison. Sister Margaret Otter. To Elizabeth, daughter of Leonard Steele Style and other daughters of said Steele. William Ashton. Brother-in-law John Otter. Brother Edward's wife. Sister Elizabeth Harrison and brother Edward executors. Witnessed by Richard Southworth and others.

Proved January 22, 1612.

(Somerby Papers, Volume 51 page 356)

(York Ar. & Top. &c. Volume 28 January 22, 1612, Southworth, Thomas, Wellam Parish Clareborough, Notts. yeoman dat. July 17, 1612 - Volume 32,f. 278).

This Thomas Southworth died before the wedding of Edward Southworth of Leyden, Holland, May 28, 1613. (A photo of the original marriage record is the frontispiece of the "Mayflower Descendant", Volume 10, and is followed by a translation and comment.) Thomas Southworth, the brother of Edward Southworth of Leyden, Holland attended Edward's wedding and Edward was given as a single man from England.

Thomas of Wellam in his will mentions "Brother Edward's wife", so Edward of Fenton and Wellam was not Edward Southworth of Leyden, Holland. Hence Walter H. Burgess and Colonel Chas. E. Banks failed in their identification of Edward Southworth of Leyden, Holland.

I was surprised to find that Burgess (footnote, page 102) quotes from the will a gift to the Vicar of Clareborough, which Somerby omits from his abstract. This shows he, Burgess, had seen the will of Thomas and yet failed to see that it nullified by its probate date that this Thomas was the Thomas who was present at his brother Edward's wedding at Leyden, Holland. He had been dead four months at least. He gives in his reference "York. Registry, Volume 32,f.278", so it was the same will.

And, Edward's will (below) also shows that Alice Carpenter was not his wife but Ann Elsam, which he stated in 1614 in the visitation quoted above, when Edward and Alice Southworth of Leyden, Holland were both alive.

EDWARD SOUTHWORTH, of Wellam, parish of Clareborough, Notts, Gentleman, November 15, 1621, to be buried in the chancel of the church. To son Edward his house and all his lands in Wellam, Wellam Moorhouse, Bollam and Gringley in said parish of Clareborough. Daughter Mary. Sister's sons viz. John, Robert and Thomas, sons of Leonard Steele Style. Thomas, son of George Harrison. Edward, son of William Ashton. Edward and John sons of John Otter. Son Edward not 21. Nephew Edm. Ashton. Brother John Otter. Appoints his father-in-law, Mr. Richard Elsam and his brother-in-law, George Harrison, executors.

Proved July 12, 1622.

(Somerby Papers, Volume 53 page 31)

The "British Gazetteer" (1910) gives - "Wellam, a village, 11 miles Northeast of Retford, Notts. Clareborough, a parish and Post-Office, three miles Northeast of Retford. Population 368. To inquiry, the Reverend T. L. Wardle, Vicar of Clareborough and Hayton made reply under date April 29, 1938, giving his address: - Hayton Vicarage, Retford, Notts. England. He was most courteous and helpful. Heden (page 2) or Headon, Notts is not Hayton.

(Marton K. Southworth)

CORRECTION: Somerby should have written Leonard STYLE instead of Steele according to Harl. Ms. 1487 fo.466ua-or aa (?), given in volume 6 of Genealogical & Hist. Notes of Yorkshire Fam. by M. M. T.: a manuscript in the Library of Congress, page 97.

Leonard Style 1612 - Married Isabell, of Auston, (daughter of (Son of Francis Style Robert Southworth of Auston and of Wellam) Elizabeth daughter of Fletcher; and the grandson of Robert Style of Auston)

John ae. 22, 1612

Robert

Thomas

Elizabeth

Susan

Margaret

Gertrude

Letter to Blackburn Grammar School at Blackburn

Under the date November 19, 1938, Mrs. Mary J. Sibley, our Genealogist, wrote to the Blackburn Grammar School at Blackburn, Lancashire, England. The gist of her letter is:

"I have examined the records of the Blackburn Grammar School, by George Alfred Stocks, published in 1909 in the Chetham Society Publication. Stocks does not list the pupils, but in the introduction he states - 'We learn names of the five who fled beyond the seas because of their complicity in the Counter-Reformation.' He does not name them. Will you kindly have someone examine your records prior to 1629 and send me what data you have, especially of Edward Southworth and his brother Thomas Southworth, and also, the two sons of Edward Southworth, Constant and Thomas - if they attended the school."

"In 1893 a local antiquarian, Mister Joseph Baron of Blackburn, to Mister Horatius W. Southworth, of the Springfield, Massachusetts Southworth, that Edward of Samlesbury went to Leyden, Holland; but did not name his authority. I am trying to find proof of this identity. Every item will be valuable. In 1602 Edward and his brothers, including Thomas, were still in the neighborhood of Samlesbury for they were all listed as foreign burgesses with their father in the Preston (Lancashire) Guild Roll of that year. They were all mentioned by their grandfather, Sir John Southworth, in his will dated September 17, 1593. Sir John died November 3, the same year."

"In 1622, William and Christopher, brothers of Edward Southworth of Samlesbury, were still on the rolls of the Preston, Lancashire Guild, but Thomas and Edward were omitted, indicating they were dead. William is given at the time of his grandfather's death (1595) as of Holcroft, Lancashire."

"The first authentic record of Edward Southworth at Leyden, Holland was on November 13, 1610, as a witness at a betrothal, which would suggest that he was then of age, and he married Alice Carpenter at Leyden, May 28, 1613, with his brother, Thomas, as his attendant, the record of which states that Edward was from England."

"A preserved letter shows that Edward Southworth, previously of Leyden, Holland was living at Heneage House, Duke's Place, Aldgate Ward, London, in 1620. He must have died in 1620, or early 1621 for his nephew stated at the time of his widow's death, in an ode in her honor, that he died young."

"I mean good Edward Southworth, who not long Continued in this world the saints among. With him she lived seven years a wife, Till death put a period to his life,"

Alice, his widow, came to Plymouth, Massachusetts on the ship Anne in 1623, and in August that year married Governor William Bradford. Edward's sons, Constant (born 1614) and Thomas (born 1616) remained in England till 1628-9, presumably to be educated. If they were pupils in Blackburn Grammar School the information would be important. Both Sir John Southworth (died 1595) and his eldest son and heir, Thomas Southworth, Esquire were Governors and contributors to the school; therefore entitled to have their sons educated there." (End of letter to Blackburn Grammar School.

1938 Petition to New England Historic Gen Soc

Since the arms brought to Plymouth by Edward's widow had a sable field and since the Samlesbury Southworths bore the same and were the only Southworths in England who did - and the heir male had used crosses patonce, flory and crosslet, it seems conclusive that Edward of Samlesbury and Edward of Leyden were identical.

This petition dated July 22, 1938 must have been submitted some time later than that date and is logically inserted here.

July 22, 1938

Committee on Heraldry, New England Historic Genealogical Society 9 Ashburton Place, Boston, Massachusetts

Gentlemen:

In registering the Southworth arm (cf. number 152) in the Second Roll the Committee finds, in the Register for July 1932: -

- 1. That the descent of Edward Southworth of Leyden, Holland from the Samlesbury, Lancashire Southworths "seemed very improbable";
- 2. "and, if the coat (Edward's in an embroidery among the effects of Governor Bradford at Plymouth, Massachusetts) in the embroidery was the coat of the Lancashire family, it was differenced to a most extraordinary extent";
- 3. "While they (American Southworths) and the Lancashire family very likely has a common origin, the embroidery furnishes strong evidence that the relationship was very remote."

However, Edward Southworth's coat was registered as the one, in all probability, belonging to the American Southworths, on the finding that it was the same as that assigned to a Thomas Southworth in the Willement Roll of Arms made about 1395.

Now, from the Willement Roll (termed the Surrey Roll by Joseph Foster in Some Feudal Coats of Arms) we have:-

"Thomas Southworth (Richard the Second Roll. 1377 - 1399) bore sable a chevron between three crosses patonce argent", which, as the committee states is the self-same shield that is in the Bradford embroidery, although Bolton's American Armory describes the latter sable a chevron between three crosses flory (i.e. crosslet?) argent. Furthermore the Surrey Roll assigns to Christopher Southworth the same arms (with a crest) as borne by Thomas Southworth; Also the Ballard Roll (Edward the Fourth 1461 - 1483) gives Christopher Southworth the same shield as Thomas, in which 'Crosses flory are intended'."

We identify the said Thomas Southworth as:-

Sir Thomas Southworth of Samlesbury, Lancashire, born knighted 1380, died April 27, 1432, son of Sir John Southworth, who died at the siege of Harfleur, France October 1415. Richard Southworth, born 1420, died December 21, 1467, succeeded his father,

said Sir Thomas Southworth. Sir Christopher Southworth, knighted 1482, died 1502, succeeded his father Richard Southworth.

We identify this Sir Christopher Southworth as he of the Surrey and Ballard Rolls. Sir John Southworth, knighted February 18, 1503 - 4 died 1519, succeeded his father, Sir Christopher Southworth. This Sir John Southworth bore, sable a chevron between three cross crosslets argent.

Sir Thomas Southworth, died 1546, succeeded his father, Sir John Southworth, died 1519.

Sir John Southworth, born about 1521, knighted 1547, died November 3, 1595, succeeded his father Sir Thomas Southworth, died 1546. The Sir John Southworth bore sable a chevron between three cross crosslets argent, crest a bull's head erased sable, horns argent. He was the grandfather of Thomas and Edward Southworth, whom he mentioned in his will.

Sir John Southworth, died November 3, 1595 was taken up for recusancy and imprisoned at Manchester, Lancashire in 1581, bailed in 1584 and by an Order in Council directed to

reside in London with his eldest son, Thomas Southworth, and which he did. Sir John Southworth was released and returned to Samlesbury in 1594.

Thomas Southworth, born 1548 and died 1617 (was the first Protestant in the family) succeeded his father, Sir John Southworth, died 1595.

The line of descent shown above is confirmed in "A History of the Ancient Hall of Samlesbury" by James Croston of London, England, published by Whittingham and Wilkins at the Chiswick Press, 1871.

The table of descent on a double quatro chart is inserted between pages 160 and 161.

These are all in the main line of the Southworths of Samlesbury, Lancashire. It is noteworthy that in every instance the field was sable, the charges argent. We maintain that Edward Southworth of Leyden, Holland, where he married Alice Carpenter, May 28, 1613, was born 1590, died 1620, the seventh and youngest son of Thomas Southworth, died 1617, of the Samlesbury main line.

Constant Southworth, born 1614 in Leyden, Holland, died March 10, 1678, Duxbury, Massachusetts and Thomas Southworth, born 1616 in Leyden, Holland, died December 8, 1669 in Plymouth, Massachusetts, were sons of Edward and Alice (Carpenter) Southworth.

Constant Southworth came to Plymouth, Massachusetts, in 1628, as is authenticated by Colonial records. Thomas Southworth came soon after, possibly by way of Cape Ann or Salem in 1629. They did not come with their mother on the Ann in 1623.

Croston's table of descent was confirmed by Mister Joseph Baron, antiquarian of Blackburn, Lancashire, and author of "Ribble Land", published by John Heywood and Company, Deansgate, Manchester, Lancashire, in which occur noteworthy references to the Southworths of Samlesbury. Mister Baron in 1893, personally declared to Mister Horatius W. Southworth, a reputable gentleman, of the Springfield, Massachusetts,

Southworths, that Edward Southworth of Leyden, Holland was the son of Thomas Southworth of Samlesbury.

Doctor Samuel G. Webber in his Genealogy of the Southworths (1905) disproves the theory of Winsor in his History of Duxbury, Massachusetts, that Edward Southworth of Leyden, Holland, was the son of Thomas Southworth, Recorder of Wells, Somersetshire, second son of Edward Southworth, merchant of London, son of Christopher Southworth, second son of Sir John Southworth of Samlesbury, died 1519. Thomas Southworth, the Recorder had no children.

Furthermore, Doctor Webber, after exhaustive research in the lines of all Edward Southworths contemporary with Alice Carpenter, who answered the proper requirements, concludes with - "the probability is so great as to amount to a certainty that Edward Southworth of Samlesbury (son of Thomas Southworth died 1617) was the father of the Southworths who came to Plymouth, Massachusetts."

Edward Southworth, son of Robert of Welham Southworth in Clarborough, Nottingham is shown by the visitation of Nottingham 1569 - 1614 to have been the husband of Ann Elsam in 1614, and was not the Edward Southworth who married Alice Carpenter at Leyden, Holland in 1613. The Nottingham branch of the Southworth family bore arms, argent a chevron gules between three crosses crosslet sable. These do not agree with the colorings in the embroidery of Alice Carpenter Southworth Bradford at Plymouth, Massachusetts. Edward Southworth, husband of Alice was not of the Nottingham Southworth branch.

The committee holds that - "the Lancashire Southworth family bore a silver shield with a black chevron and crosses crosslet." We contend that these represent reverse colorings, and are of a branch of the Southworth family descended from a second son, as from the Visitation of Somersetshire 1623 they are ascribed to Henry of Weeks Champflower, and Thomas Southworth, Recorder of Wells, sons of Edward Southworth, merchant of London, son of Christopher Southworth, second son of Sir John Southworth of Samlesbury, died 1519.

The quartered arms on the wall of the chapel at Samlesbury reveal first and fourth quarters with a sable field, while the second and third are argent. What could be more conclusive that the mail line bore a sable shield? In justice, the committees' finding should be corrected. In Doctor Webber's Genealogy is a picture of the arms in the Samlesbury Chapel.

Mrs. Mary J. Sibley of Syracuse, New York (M.J.S. of the Boston Transcript "Southworth" articles) in the issue of that newspaper for August 31, and November 6, 1931, quoting Doctor Henry M. Dexter from "English Exiles in Amsterdam", names as present there a "Mister (gentry) Southworth, Jane Southworth, doubtless an Aunt or sister-in-law of Edward Southworth of Samlesbury, who had both, so named; Also six Pygotts, one named Matthew. The maternal grandmother of said Edward Southworth was Bridget Pygott, and she had a son Matthew Lister, annuitant under Thomas Southworth, father of said Edward Southworth, as provided in the will of Matthew's father, Sir William Lister. Later Matthew became a physician to royalty and was knighted.

Edward Lister, elder brother of Sir Matthew Lister, was a physician in ordinary to Queen Elizabeth. He lived in Aldgate, parish of Saint Mary Aldermanbury and was buried within the parish church. Thus an uncle of Edward Southworth of Samlesbury lived in Aldgate when Edward Southworth of Leyden and other Pilgrims were there.

Edward Southworth of Leyden and wife, Alice, lived in Heneage House, Dukes Place, Aldgate, London, as evidenced by a letter written to Edward Southworth by Robert Cushman, business agent of the Pilgrims. The letter was dated from Dartmouth, England, August 17, 1620 and is now in the Massachusetts Historical Society archives at Boston.

Mary J. Sibley - Boston Transcript, August 31, 1931, relates that Sir Francis Walsingham (who was the Secretary of State, and a warm friend of Thomas Southworth, father of Edward Southworth of Samlesbury) lived opposite Heneage House in Dukes Place, and was responsible for Sir John's freedom on bail in London, while the latter was actually under the charge of his son, Thomas Southworth, who with his wife lived in London, 1584-1594. Thus it is likely that Edward Southworth was born there (1590), and it would be more than a mere coincidence, but natural, that Edward Southworth should return and live in Dukes Place when in London, 1620. Walsingham died in Aldgate, 1590.

Mary J. Sibley - Boston Transcript, November 6, 1931, shows from records of the Preston, Lancashire, Guild that Edward Southworth of Samlesbury died young before 1622. Edward Southworth of Leyden and London likewise died young, late in 1620, as per his nephew, Nathaniel Morton, Secretary of Plymouth Colony, in his "New England Memorial".

Again, Mary J. Sibley - Boston Transcript, November 6, 1931, to quote:- "With test of known facts I eliminated all other Edward Southworths I had found in London and elsewhere. Edward Southworth of Samlesbury stood this test, and was the only one who did. I made my intensive search to see if it would reveal any reason why said Edward Southworth of Samlesbury could not be identified with Edward Southworth of Leyden, and I found none".

Further:- "I found crosses flory among the arms of the Samlesbury Hall Southworths, and in their colorings and since they were the main family all others would have been reversed colorings. This gives positive identification of the arms."

Mary J. Sibley - Concludes her Boston Transcript, November 6, 1931, article with:- "Why should Edward Southworth's widow and children care to possess a memorial (the arms in the embroidery) to a deceased member of the Samlesbury Hall Southworths if it were not our family? And they would know as to that." [They were arms of Southworth of Clarborough]

We desire to certify to recognition and thankful appreciation of the work of the Committee, and trust that we may not appear over-critical. However, we feel strongly that we are entitled to reconsideration of the three numbered citations at top of page 1 herein, as they are at variance with the facts. We would respectfully request a revision, which might also show both Thomas and Christopher as having borne the same arms which were handed down in America.

Likewise to keep the record straight, - Constant Southworth came to Plymouth in 1628 and his brother Thomas Southworth soon after, not "With their mother."

Doctor Bowditch, Secretary of your Committee, has been interviewed, proved himself most courteous and helpful, is appraised of this, our present action, and we are encouraged in the belief that it meets with his approbation.

Respectfully submitted,

Merton K. Southworth, 65 Warren Avenue, Wollaston, Massachusetts Eugene C. Southworth, Marion Court Clifford E. Southworth, 9 Colver Street, New London, Conn. Roswell L. Southworth, 54 Dudley Avenue, Coninicut, R.I. Melvin D. Southworth, (1558) 6 Crescent Hill, Springfield, Massachusetts Galward Southworth, 42 Magnolia Terrace, Springfield, Massachusetts Rev. Franklyn C. Southworth (4229) Maraside, Little Compton, R. I. Constant Southworth (1555) 4000 Cathedral Avenue, Washington. D. C. Franklin C. Southworth 521 Ashland Avenue, Buffalo, New York. H. Brewster Southworth, Garison Road, Hingham, Massachusetts Clarence E. Southworth. 157 River Street, Braintree, Massachusetts S. D. Southworth. 714 Washington Street, Braintree, Massachusetts Charles E. Southworth, 31 Holland Terrace, Needham, Massachusetts Robert A. Southworth, 14 Midland Street, Boston, Massachusetts Winthrop M. Southworth, 81 Powers Street, Needham, Massachusetts George W. Southworth, 23 Lincoln Street, Needham, Massachusetts Dana B. Southworth, 97 St. Stephen Street, Boston, Massachusetts George E. Southworth, 2 Southworth Trail, Milford, Conn. Arthur P. Southworth, 11 Shefield Road, Wakefield, Massachusetts Constance E. Southworth, 65 Warren Avenue, Wallaston, Massachusetts Alice H. Southworth, Briarwood, Southern Pines, North Carolina. Dr. Thomas S. Southworth, 530 Fifth Avenue, New York, New York. Harriet Southworth, 775 Port Avenue, Hasbing? Rev. George S. Southworth, (1560) 538 North Talawan Street, Indianapolis, Ind. Elisabeth Southworth Harrison, (1557) 347 N Audubon Road, Indianapolis, Ind. Dr. Rufas Southworth, (1556) Fauntaire Avenue, Glendale, Ohio. Dr. John D. Southworth, (1561) 23 Washington Street, Rutland, Vt. George Asahel Southworth, (4366) 402 College Avenue, Northfield, Minn. Asahel Dimmick Southworth, 304 East 4th Street, Northfield, Minn.

Southworth Company Paper Manufactures Established 1839
West Springfield Massachusetts U.S.A.

1940 letter with results of Petition

December 10, 1940

Mister George Asahel Southworth 402 College Street Northfield, Minnesota

Dear Mister Southworth:

I must apologize for not having acknowledged your valued letter of November 20, 1940. I certainly appreciate the names you have given me and the interest you have taken in the use of our paper. I will send a sample book to each of the persons and advise them where they can pick up our paper.

I am more than chagrined that I did not report to you the result of our petition on the Southworth Coat of Arms. I am enclosing herewith a newspaper clipping from the Boston Transcript under the date of November 11, 1939, which shows the New England Historical Society acted favorably upon our petition.

As you know the Southworth Coat of Arms is registered in what is called part two of the Roll of Arms published by the Committee on Heraldry of the New England Historical and Genealogical Society.

As the notice states, they have corrected the same in the fourth part. I am enclosing herewith a postal card I received in October, advising us the fourth part had been published which can be purchased for \$1.00. You will notice they still have copies of the first, second and third parts available at a dollar each, and if you are interested by sending in \$2.00, you can get the fourth part and also the second part, which are the only two that we are interested in.

With Kindest regards, beg to remain

Very Sincerely yours,

MDS:DC

Melvin D. Southworth

Boston Transcript, November 11, 1939

Notes

SOUTHWORTH ARMS

Comment on Note 29986. January 27, 1938. Under the above caption this department gave an extract from the Introduction to the Second Roll of Arms, by the Committee on Heraldry as printed in New England Historical and Genealogical Register for July, 1932.

Interested members of the Southworth family could not accept three premises therein as:

- (1) That decent of Edward Southworth of Leyden, Holland from the Samlesbury, Lancashire, Southworth "seemed very improbable."
- (2) If the coat in the embroidery (Edward's, at Plymouth, Massachusetts) was the coat of the Lancashire family, it was differenced to a most extraordinary extent."
- (3) That the embroidery furnished strong evidence that the relationship of American Southworths and the Lancashire family "was very remote."

The committee on Heraldry took up the case anew and in the current (October) Register, page 395, issued the following:

"THE SOUTHWORTH ARMS - A CORRECTION.

In the "Introduction" to the Second Roll of the Arms of the Society's Committee on Heraldry, Register, Volume 86 pages 258 ff, certain statements in regard to the Southworth arms were made which it now seems, in the light of certain facts brought to the attention of the committee by members of the Southworth family, should be modified or corrected.

Summary & Findings

The purpose of this discussion is to bring together several of the sources to which a certin amount of authority has been granted, without being warranted. A critical review of these sources, with the errors being *highlighted* and *[my comments]* interspersed, will hopefully, direct future researchers to not duplicate research that has already been done. It is also my hope that this will help to put an end to the brainless repetition of the errors found in these pieces as well as the errant suppositions.

The articles included and reviewed display a startling and significant amount of ineptitude. Most notably is the poor understanding of heraldry shown by the decision rendered by the Committee on Heraldry of the New England Historic Genealogical Society and the *petition* submitted challenging that *decision*. The *decision* was insubstantial and contained an incorrect analysis of the arms under discussion. The Committee lacked the requisite knowledge to understand the process by which a differenced arms is adopted; it is not a different arms as found in Alleged Royal Ancestry of Edward Southworth. The differenced arms of red on white, the original being black on white for Southworth and white on black for Samlesbury, are a definite indicator of a close familial connection between the two branches. This connection would be shown by the adoption of a differenced arms by a brother, or brother-in-law via marriage to a sister, of the person who inherited the original arms. But that is not the only condition to apply; the bearer of the differenced arms would be located some distance away from the seat of the family. If they were in the same area, the arms would be *charged* arms, not differenced arms. Charged arms are the same as the original arms with a cadency device added, such as a ring, a sign that the holder was the 5th son of the holder of the original arms. There was a complicated system of charges that denoted a 2nd son versus a 3rd son, all the way to a 9th son. The Nottingham arms are not *charged* arms; they are *differenced* as the change in tincture indicates. There was no standardized system for differenced arms but a change in tincture was the most common way to possess a differenced arms. Technically neither version whether *charged* or *differenced* were officially recognized in England. However, a person bearing someone else's arms with a cadency device, without having the right to do so, could be forced to discontinue the practice through various, and often unpleasant, measures. There was no document granting the use of differenced arms to a particular member of a family. Charged arms, on the other hand, were recognized and, in theory, regulated in Scotland. Charged arms duplicated the original arms and had a *cadency* device added that was specific to one son and one son, and his family, only. The arms themselves declared who the original belonged to and the device told everyone that the holder was the heir-presumptive or eldest son if it was a three-pointed label, the second son if it was a *crescent*, the third son if it was star or *mullet*, and so on of the holder of the original arms. This system fell out of favor rather quickly because multiple cadency marks were required rather quickly – the second son of the third son of the original holder had both his father's cadency mark, a *mullet* as the 3rd son, and his own as the 2nd son, a *crescent*. Beyond that confusion, there were also frequent duplications of charged arms such that uncles and nephews bore the same charged arms. The uncle. being a 2nd son of, had a *crescent* on his arms. The eldest son, the heir presumptive, had arms that bore a three-pointed label until he inherited the original arms when his father died. His eldest son bore arms with a five-pointed label while his 2nd son, the nephew in our example, bore arms with a *crescent* – the same arms as his uncle. So, we have a

branch of the Samlesbury family living at some distance away from the seat of the family. But that isn't the entire story either. The splinter branch must also have been vested with enough property to belong to the class of people who were *armigerous* or capable of bearing arms. In 1400, John Southworth, the eldest son of Thomas Southworth *enfeoffed* the Southworth lands, meaning they were put in a trust. After he died in 1415, his son and heir Thomas Southworth distributed the properties in 1420, presumably according to the terms of the trust. His brother Matthew received the properties in Lincolnshire, Somersetshire, & Dorsetshire. The Yorks/Notts properties were granted to his brother John Southworth, his wife being Ellen de Boton. However, it also appears that the Yorks/Notts cadet branch *failed* within 2 or 3 generations, *i.e.* there were no heirs to inherit the lands so they reverted to the senior branch.

After this initial attempt at land distribution, they seemed to have been used as dower lands but because we do not know the details of the dower agreements, we are left to guess at who was the person who received the properties with the right to bequeath them to their heirs rather than having them be returned to the senior branch upon some triggering act, usually the death of the daughter receiving the dowry. That the eldest daughter received the Yorks/Notts properties as a dowry is a very real possibility especially if you are familiar with land customs of the time period. When the wife brought to the marriage parcels of land as part of her dowry, they would become part of the joint properties. Immediately prior to the marriage the soon-to-be-wife received dower lands – not dowry – from her husband or, more likely, father-in-law. Her dower lands were for her sole use and as she had received them before marrying, they were her property, not her husbands. The value of the dowry and dower lands were usually on par with each other. The properties making up the Yorks-Notts estate were, in large, brought to the Southworth family by the marriage to a Foliot. It was not unusual to have properties brought into a family as the wife's dowry to be used for the dowry of the eldest daughter and it does seem the Foliot properties were used in this manner more than once which means those properties were, in effect, *loaned* to the daughter and her family to use during her life after which they returned to the senior branch of the family.

Another possibility that was much more common then compared to now, was that the dowry was granted on a more-or-less permanent transfer with rights if inheritance. This was often done with the stipulation that the husband adopt her surname. It was commonplace to require a surname change before taking possession of land and, in this case, it appears that the Southworth name was ultimately carried to Notts by a daughter, not a son.

This premise is supported by the research done by the Southworth DNA Project. If the properties pssed through a daughter, the expected result would be that there would be no *y-DNA* match, *i.e.* in the male line, between descendants of the Southworth of Samlesbury and Southworth of Notts families, and that is exactly what the Project demonstrated. This confirms half of this premise – the properties did not pass through the male line of descent, at least with the first generation of transfer.

There are two ways to prove the other half of the premise – the properties passed through the female line. In an ideal world, primary written evidence attesting to the properties going through a female Southworth would be found; that is the gold-standard. Barring that, a second possibility exists if a *mitochndrial* DNA match, *i.e.* in the female line, can

be made. Unfortunately, making such a match has a full set of problems to address, not the least of which is the fact that families intermarried so frequently that it is difficult to find a descendant alive today that can categorically state, and prove, they are only descended from one specific female Southworth. This means that none of the ancestors intervening between the person making that claim and the female Southworth they descend from, could have a Southworth ancestor in a different line. There is also the complication of thenumber of intervening generations. Once you reach back 6 generations, the likelihood that the DNA of one ancestor will be missed completely is so great as to make it impossible to determine what the accurate ancestry of any one person is. Whether or not this limitation is specific to the *y-DNA* only or both the *y-DNA* and *mitochndrial* DNA is not clearly understood.